UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA

IN RE PORK ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Case No. 0:18-cv-01776 (JRT/HB)

This Document Relates to: All Actions

STIPULATION CONCERNING EXPERT DISCOVERY

The parties¹ in the above-captioned cases, through their respective counsel of record, stipulate to the following regarding the scope of expert reports and discovery in the above-captioned matters and all other matters subsequently consolidated with them (collectively, the "Actions"), subject to approval by the Court.

- 1. This Stipulation Concerning Expert Discovery ("Stipulation") does not set or alter the time for any disclosure required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(B) or the timing of any deadlines set forth in any operative scheduling orders entered in this case.
- 2. To the extent that this Stipulation imposes limitations on discovery that would otherwise be available under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure or this Court's standing orders, the parties have agreed to those limitations to increase the efficiency of their dealings with testifying experts and to minimize discovery disputes regarding testifying experts. Neither the terms of this Stipulation nor the parties' agreement to them

¹ This Stipulation and Order Concerning Expert Discovery shall govern the parties in the above-captioned cases, whether they currently are involved or become so in the future, and in any related actions that may later be consolidated with this case.

shall be considered an admission by any party that any of the information restricted from discovery by this Stipulation would otherwise be discoverable or admissible.

- 3. The parties agree to modify their Rule 26(a)(2)(B)(ii) disclosure obligations to require disclosure of "the facts, data, or other information relied on by the witness in forming them." For the purpose of defining their discovery obligations in this litigation, the parties agree that Rule 26(b)(4)(C)(ii) shall be treated as if it reads: "identify facts or data that the party's attorney provided and that the expert relied on in forming the opinions to be expressed." The parties also agree that Rule 26(a)(2)(B)(vi) shall be treated as if it reads: "a statement of the compensation to be paid for the study and testimony in the case, including the hourly rate to be paid for the testifying expert's time in the case."
- 4. Subject to the limitations of Rule 26(b)(4)(C), as modified by Paragraph 3 above or the provisions of this paragraph below, the following types of information shall not be the subject of any form of discovery and the parties shall not be obligated to preserve such information in any form or include such information on any privilege log:
 - a. all written or oral communications in connection with this matter among and between the testifying expert and consultants, counsel, other experts, and/or staff or among any of these actors in connection with this matter, including, but not limited to:
 - i. counsel and counsel's staff and the testifying expert and/or the expert's staff and/or supporting firms;
 - ii. counsel and counsel's staff and any non-testifying expert consultant and/or the consultant's staff;

- iii. the expert and other experts and/or other non-testifying expert consultants;
- iv. experts and their staff and/or supporting firms;
- v. non-testifying expert consultants and their staffs; and/or
- vi. the respective staffs and/or supporting firms of testifying experts or non-testifying expert consultants and the staffs and/or supporting firms of other experts or non-testifying expert consultants;
- b. all written or oral communications relating to the deposition of the testifying expert;
- c. all work performed by non-testifying consultants;
- d. all written or oral communications or other materials relating to interviews of or the potential retention of experts or consultants;
- e. drafts of (i) final reports, (ii) written testimony, (iii) affidavits, (iv) declarations, or (v) other written materials prepared in connection with this matter;
- f. preliminary or intermediate calculations, computations, or other data runs, or other types of preliminary work created by, for, or at the direction of a testifying expert by consultants, counsel, other experts, and/or staff, unless they are relied upon by the expert to formulate his or her opinions;

- g. any notes, analyses, comments, or other writings taken or prepared by or for a testifying expert in connection with this matter unless they are relied upon by the expert to formulate his or her opinions; and
- h. budgets, invoices, bills, receipts, or time records concerning testifying or non-testifying expert witnesses or consultants, their staff, assistants, colleagues, or associates, or their companies or organizations, except an expert may be asked reasonable questions regarding the compensation of the expert and his or her staff, the amount of time an expert or that expert's staff has spent on the expert's report and associated work, and the amount of money billed for the report and associated work.
- 5. The limitations contained in Paragraph 4 shall not apply to any communications, documents, data sets, data runs, calculations, computations, or other forms of information or work upon which a testifying expert relies as a basis for any of his or her opinions whether expressed in reports, affidavits, declarations, or testimony.
- 6. Except as set forth in Paragraph 4, in addition to what is required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26, for each testifying expert designated by the parties, the designating party will, within three (3) business days of serving an expert report, affidavit, or declaration pursuant to Rule 26(a)(2)(B) or otherwise, produce:
 - a. copies of the data, materials, and/or other information relied upon by
 the testifying expert in forming the expert witness's opinions,
 including all raw and final electronic data sets and electronic data

563884.1 4

compilations in the form or format used for the expert's calculations; provided, however, that materials produced previously in this action (except for the raw data sets) need not be re-produced, but may be identified by Bates number, and that materials publicly available online need not be produced, but may be identified by website, title, and date or a working URL;

- b. the input, programs, and output underlying all calculations relied upon in forming the testifying expert's opinions and/or needed to replicate or reproduce the expert's disclosed tables, figures, calculations, and reported results, including underlying raw and final data, spreadsheets, computerized regression analysis, and/or other underlying reports and schedules sufficient to reconstruct the work, calculations, and/or analyses upon which the expert witness is relying for his or her opinions; and
- c. any information (including, but not limited to, analyses, spreadsheets, graphs, and charts) relied upon by the testifying expert that is based on the output from any computer programs that are produced.
- 7. The information required by Paragraph 6 above to be produced shall be produced electronically (via email, disc or FTP site) where reasonably feasible. Data, statistical analyses, or other information (including any calculation or exhibit) upon which an expert relies for any of his or her opinion(s) in this matter shall be provided in machine readable format, including any data that has been cleaned, reformatted, or modified in any

563884.1 5

way from the form in which it may have been provided to the expert. All other documents, data, and other information relied upon shall be provided in a format as agreed to by the parties, along with any software and instructions required to read them, but no party need produce computer software or instructions that are reasonably and commercially available (e.g., Microsoft Word, Excel, STATA, SAS). Documents that are publicly available shall be identified by internet addresses where the materials can be accessed or obtained. Documents that have previously been produced during discovery need not be produced if they are identified by Bates number.

- 8. This stipulation is not intended to limit the ability of any party to prepare and use demonstrative exhibits, including demonstrative exhibits that may relate to an expert's testimony, during the course of any hearing or trial. The admissibility of any such demonstrative exhibits shall be subject to the Federal Rules of Evidence, the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and this Court's Local Rules, unless otherwise provided by order of the Court.
- 9. No subpoens (for depositions or documents) need be served on any testifying expert from whom a report, affidavit, or declaration is provided. Instead, the party proffering such expert will (a) be responsible for producing all materials and information relied on by the expert as outlined above, and (b) make the expert available for deposition at a time mutually agreed to by the parties and consistent with the Court's scheduling orders.
- 10. Nothing in this Stipulation shall permit a party or a testifying expert to withhold any proposition, fact, belief, or other data, information, or material on which the

expert relies in support of her or his opinion(s) in this matter, or to prevent substantive deposition questions with respect to any data or other non-privileged information that may be relevant to the substance of the testifying expert's opinions, including, but not limited to: (i) theories, methodologies, yardsticks, benchmarks, variables, data, facts, or assumptions that the expert relied on in forming his or her opinions; (ii) the assumptions or facts, if any, that the party's attorney provided and that the expert relied on in forming the opinions expressed; or (iii) any other assumptions that the expert may have relied upon in preparing his or her report. However, such questions may not specifically concern the wording or contents of any drafts of the expert's reports, affidavits, declarations, written testimony, or other written materials on which the expert did not rely in forming his or her expressed opinions.

11. The parties agree to comply with this Stipulation pending the Court's approval.

DATED: November 29, 2021

/s/ Bobby Pouya

Bobby Pouya
Clifford H. Pearson
Daniel L. Warshaw
Michael H. Pearson
PEARSON SIMON & WARSHAW, LLP
15165 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 400
Sherman Oaks, CA 92403
T: (818) 788-8300
cpearson@pswlaw.com
dwarshaw@pswlaw.com
bpouya@pswlaw.com
mpearson@pswlaw.com

Melissa S. Weiner (MN #0387900) PEARSON, SIMON & WARSHAW, LLP 800 LaSalle Avenue, Suite 2150 Minneapolis, MN 55402 T: (612) 389-0600 mweiner@pswlaw.com

Bruce L. Simon
Benjamin E. Shiftan
Neil Swartzberg
PEARSON, SIMON & WARSHAW, LLP
350 Sansome Street, Suite 680
San Francisco, CA 94104
T: (415) 433-9000
F: (415) 433-9008
bsimon@pswlaw.com
bshiftan@pswlaw.com
nswartzberg@pswlaw.com

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph C. Bourne

Joseph C. Bourne (MN #0389922) W. Joseph Bruckner (MN #0147758) Brian D. Clark (MN #0390069) Arielle S. Wagner (MN #0398332) Craig S. Davis (MN #0148192) Simeon A. Morbey (MN #0391338) Stephen M. Owen (MN # 0399370) LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P. 100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200 Minneapolis, MN 55401 T: (612) 339-6900 jcbourne@locklaw.com wjbruckner@locklaw.com bdclark@locklaw.com aswagner@locklaw.com csdavis@locklaw.com samorbey@locklaw.com smowen@locklaw.com

Co-Lead Class Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs

/s/ Shana E. Scarlett

Shana E. Scarlett

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202

Berkeley, CA 94710

T: (510) 725-3000

shanas@hbsslaw.com

Steve. W. Berman

Breanna Van Engelen

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

1301 2nd Avenue, Suite 2000

Seattle, WA 98101

T: (206) 623-7292

steve@hbsslaw.com

breannay@hbsslaw.com

/s/ Daniel E. Gustafson

Daniel E. Gustafson (#202241)

Daniel C. Hedlund (#258337)

Michelle J. Looby (#388166)

Brittany N. Resch (#0397656)

GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC

120 South 6th Street, Suite 2600

Minneapolis, MN 55402

T: (612) 333-8844

dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com

dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com

mlooby@gustafsongluek.com

bresch@gustafsongluek.com

Co-Lead Counsel for Consumer Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs

/s/ Shawn M. Raiter

Shawn M. Raiter (MN# 240424)

LARSON • KING, LLP

2800 Wells Fargo Place

30 East Seventh Street

St. Paul, MN 55101

T: (651) 312-6518

sraiter@larsonking.com

Jonathan W. Cuneo

Joel Davidow

Blaine Finley

Yifei "Evelyn" Li

CUNEO GILBERT & LADUCA, LLP

4725 Wisconsin Avenue NW, Suite 200

Washington, DC 20016

T: (202) 789-3960

ionc@cuneolaw.com

joel@cuneolaw.com

bfinley@cuneolaw.com

evelyn@cunelolaw.com

Co-Lead Counsel for Commercial and Institutional Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs

/s/ Kyle G. Bates

Kyle G. Bates HAUSFELD LLP 600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200 San Francisco, CA 94111 T: (415) 633-1908 kbates@hausfled.com

Peter B. Schneider SCHNEIDER WALLACE COTTRELL KONECKY WOTKYNS LLP 3700 Buffalo Speedway, Suite 300 Houston, Texas 77098 T: (713) 338-2560 F: (415)421-7105 pschneider@schneiderwallace.com

Todd M. Schneider
Matthew S. Weiler
SCHNEIDER WALLACE COTTRELL
KONECKY WOTKYNS LLP
2000 Powell St., Suite 1400
Emeryville, California 94608
T: (415) 421-7100
tschneider@schneiderwallace.com
mweiler@schneiderwallace.com

/s/ Robert N. Kaplan

Robert N. Kaplan
Matthew P. McCahill
Jason A. Uris
KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER, LLP
850 Third Avenue, 14th Floor
New York, New York 10022
T: (212) 687-1980
rkaplan@kaplanfox.com
mmccahill@kaplanfox.com
juris@kaplanfox.com

Garrett W. Wotkyns SCHNEIDER WALLACE COTTRELL KONECKY WOTKYNS LLP 8501 N. Scottsdale Road, Suite 270 Scottsdale, Arizona 85253 T: (480) 428-0145 gwotkyns@schneiderwallace.com

Domingo Emanuelli-Hernández
Attorney General
Guarionex Díaz Martínez
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust Division
Puerto Rico Department of Justice
P.O. Box 9020192
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00902-0192
T: (787) 721-2900, ext. 2600, 2601
F: (787) 721-3223
gdiaz@justicia.pr.gov

Counsel for the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico

/s/ Eric R. Lifvendahl
Eric R. Lifvendahl
Ryan F. Manion
L&G LAW GROUP, LLP
175 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 950
Chicago, Illinois 60604
T: (312) 364-2500
elifvendahl@lgcounsel.com
rmanion@lgcounsel.com

/s/ Richard L. Coffman

Richard L. Coffman THE COFFMAN LAW FIRM 3355 W. Alabama St., Suite 240 Houston, Texas 77098 T: (713) 528-6700 rcoffman@coffmanlawfirm.com /s/ Bernard D. Marcus

Bernard D. Marcus
Moira Cain-Mannix
Brian C. Hill
Rachel A. Beckman
MARCUS & SHAPIRA LLP
One Oxford Center, 35th Floor
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219
T: (412) 471-3490
marcus@marcus-shapira.com
cain-mannix@marcus-shapira.com
hill@marcus-shapira.com
beckman@marcus-shapira.com

Counsel for MDL DAPs Action Meat
Distributors, Inc., Topco Associates, LLC, Alex
Lee, Inc./Merchants Distributors, LLC,
Associated Food Stores, Inc., Brookshire
Grocery Company, Colorado Boxed Beef Co.,
Certco, Inc., The Golub Corporation, Nicholas
& Co., PFD Enterprises, Inc., SpartanNash
Company, Springfield Grocer Company, The
Distribution Group d/b/a Van Eerden
Foodservice Co., Troyer Foods, Inc., URM
Stores, Inc., and Giant Eagle, Inc.

/s/ David C. Eddy

David C. Eddy Dennis J. Lynch Travis C. Wheeler Chase C. Keibler

NEXSEN PRUET, LLC 1230 Main Street, Suite 700 Columbia, South Carolina 29201

T: (803) 771-8900

deddy@nexsenpruet.com dlynch@nexsenpruet.com twheeler@nexsenpruet.com ckeibler@nexsenpruet.com

Counsel for MDL DAPs Conagra Brands, Inc., Nestlé USA, Inc., and Nestlé Purina PetCare Co.

/s/ Scott E. Gant

Scott E. Gant
Michael S. Mitchell
Sarah L. Jones
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
1401 New York Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20005
T: 202-237-2727
sgant@bsfllp.com
mmitchell@bsfllp.com
sjones@bsfllp.com

/s/ David B. Esau

David B. Esau Kristin A. Gore Garth T. Yearick CARLTON FIELDS, P.A. 525 Okeechobee Boulevard, Suite 1200 West Palm Beach, Florida 33401 T: (561) 659-7070

gyearick@carltonfields.com kgore@carltonfields.com desau@carltonfields.com

Counsel for MDL DAPs Cheney Brothers, Inc. and Subway Protein Litigation Corp., as litigation trustee of the Subway® Protein Litigation Trust

Colleen Harrison BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP 333 Main Street Armonk, NY 10504 T: 914-749-8204 charrison@bsfllp.com

Counsel for MDL DAPs Sysco Corporation and Amory Investments LLC

/s/ Patrick J. Ahern

Patrick J. Ahern
Theodore B. Bell
AHERN & ASSOCIATES, P.C.
Willoughby Tower
8 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 3600
Chicago, Illinois 60603
T: (312) 404-3760
patrick.ahern@ahernandassociatespc.com

theo.bell@ahernandassociatespc.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs Winn-Dixie Stores, Inc.; Bi-Lo Holdings, LLC; and Kraft Heinz Foods Company

/s/ Philip J. Iovieno

Philip J. Iovieno

Nicholas A. Gravante, Jr.

Karen C. Dyer

Lawrence S. Brandman

Jack G. Stern

Gillian Groarke Burns

Mark A. Singer

Elizabeth R. Moore

CADWALADER, WICKERSHAM & TAFT LLP

200 Liberty Street

New York, NY 10281

T: (212) 504-6000

philip.iovieno@cwt.com

nicholas.gravante@cwt.com

karen.dyer@cwt.com

lawrence.brandman@cwt.com

jack.stern@cwt.com

gillian.burns@cwt.com

mark.singer@cwt.com

elizabeth.moore@cwt.com

Counsel for MDL DAPs Jetro Holdings, LLC and BJ's Wholesale Club, Inc. and Co-Counsel for Plaintiffs Kraft Heinz Foods Company; Winn-Dixie Stores, Inc.; and Bi-Lo Holdings, LLC

/s/ Mark L. Johnson

Mark L. Johnson (#0345520)
Davida S. McGhee (#0400175)
GREENE ESPEL PLLP
222 South Ninth Street, Suite 2200
Minneapolis, MN 55402
T: (612) 373-0830
mjohnson@greeneespel.com
vmccalmont@greeneespel.com

Daniel Laytin, P.C. (pro hac vice) Christa Cottrell, P.C. (pro hac vice) KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP 300 North LaSalle Chicago, IL 60654 Telephone: (312) 861-2000 daniel.laytin@kirkland.com christa.cottrell@kirkland.com

Counsel for Clemens Food Group, LLC and The Clemens Family Corporation

/s/ Donald G. Heeman

Donald G. Heeman (#0286023)
Jessica J. Nelson (#0347358)
Randi J. Winter (#0391354)
SPENCER FANE LLP
100 South Fifth Street, Suite 2500
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: (612) 268-7000
dheeman@spencerfane.com
jnelson@spencerfane.com
rwinter@spencerfane.com

/s/ Richard A. Duncan

Richard A. Duncan (#0192983) Aaron D. Van Oort (#0315539) Craig S. Coleman (#0325491) Emily E. Chow (#0388239) Isaac B. Hall (#0395398) Bryan K. Washburn (#0397733) FAEGRE DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP 2200 Wells Fargo Center 90 South Seventh Street Minneapolis, MN 55402-3901 T: (612) 766-7000 richard.duncan@faegredrinker.com aaron.vanoort@faegredrinker.com craig.coleman@faegredrinker.com emily.chow@faegredrinker.com isaac.hall@faegredrinker.com bryan.washburn@faegredrinker.com

Counsel for Hormel Foods Corporation and Hormel Foods, LLC

/s/ William L. Greene

William L. Greene (#0198730)
Peter J. Schwingler (#0388909)
Jon M. Woodruff (#0399453)
STINSON LLP
50 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: (612) 335-1500
william.greene@stinson.com
peter.schwingler@stinson.com
jon.woodruff@stinson.com

Stephen R. Neuwirth (pro hac vice)
Michael B. Carlinsky (pro hac vice)
Sami H. Rashid (pro hac vice)
Richard T. Vagas (pro hac vice)
David B. Adler (pro hac vice)
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
Telephone: (212) 849-7000
stephenneuwirth@quinnemanuel.com
michaelcarlinsky@quinnemanuel.com
richardvagas@quinnemanuel.com
davidadler@quinnemanuel.com

J. Nicci Warr (*pro hac vice*) STINSON LLP 7700 Forsyth Blvd., Suite 1100 St. Louis, MO 63105 Telephone: (314) 863-0800 nicci.warr@stinson.com

Counsel for Seaboard Foods LLC and Seaboard Corporation

Counsel for JBS USA Food Company

/s/ John A. Cotter

John A. Cotter (#0134296)
John A. Kvinge (#0392303)
LARKIN HOFFMAN DALY &
LINDGREN LTD.
8300 Norman Center Drive, Suite 1000
Minneapolis, MN 55427-1060
Telephone: (952) 835-3800
jcotter@larkinhoffman.com
jkvinge@larkinhoffman.com

Richard Parker (pro hac vice)
Josh Lipton (pro hac vice)
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER, LLP
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036-5306
Telephone: (202) 955-8500
rparker@gibsondunn.com
jlipton@gibsondunn.com

/s/ Aaron Chapin

Aaron Chapin (#06292540) HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP 120 South Riverside Plaza, Suite 2200 Chicago, IL 60606 Telephone: (312) 655-1500 aaron.chapin@huschblackwell.com

Marnie Jensen (pro hac vice)
Ryann Glenn (pro hac vice)
Kamron Hasan (pro hac vice)
Sierra Faler (pro hac vice)
HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP
13330 California St., Suite 200
Omaha, NE 68154
Telephone: (402) 964-5000
marnie.jensen@huschblackwell.com
ryann.glenn@huschblackwell.com
sierra.faler@huschblackwell.com

Brian Robison (*pro hac vice*) GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER, LLP 2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 2100 Dallas, TX 75201-6912 Telephone: (214) 698-3370 brobison@gibsondunn.com

Counsel for Smithfield Foods, Inc.

<u>/s/ David P. Graham</u>

David P. Graham (#0185462) DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC 4000 Wells Fargo Center 90 South Seventh Street Minneapolis, MN 55402 Telephone: (612) 486-1521 dgraham@dykema.com

Rachel J. Adcox (pro hac vice)
Tiffany Rider Rohrbaugh (pro hac vice)
AXINN, VELTROP &
HARKRIDER LLP
950 F Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004
Telephone: (202) 912-4700
radcox@axinn.com
trider@axinn.com

Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Prepared Foods, Inc. and Tyson Fresh Meats, Inc. Christopher A. Smith HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP 190 Carondelet Plaza, Suite 600 St. Louis, MO 63105 Telephone: (314) 480-1500 Facsimile: (314) 480-1505 chris.smith@huschblackwell.com

Counsel for Triumph Foods, LLC

/s/ Peter H. Walsh

Peter H. Walsh (#0388672)
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
80 South Eighth Street, Suite 1225
Minneapolis, MN 55402
T. (612) 402-3000
F. (612) 402-3001
peter.walsh@hoganlovells.com

William L. Monts (pro hac vice)
Justin W. Bernick (pro hac vice)
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
Columbia Square
555 Thirteenth Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20004
Telephone: (202) 637-5600
william.monts@hoganlovells.com
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com

Counsel for Agri Stats, Inc.